

---

Re: Follow up Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

---

From Inke Nathke (Staff) <i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk>

Date Mon 29/07/2024 11:32

To 

Dear 

Thank you very much for letting me know!

Best wishes

Inke

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke N athke, FRSE** (she/her/hers)

Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture

Research Integrity Lead

School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee

+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)

PA: Kirsty Forbes | [kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk)

<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>

<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



 [University of Dundee Twitter](#)



The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

---

**From:** 

**Date:** Monday, 29 July 2024 at 11:10

**To:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk>

**Subject:** RE: Follow up Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

CAUTION: This email originated from outside the University of Dundee. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender's email address and know the content is safe.

Dear Inke,

The retraction has been published now: [https://doi.org/10.1042/BJ20041782\\_RET](https://doi.org/10.1042/BJ20041782_RET).

Best wishes,

**Biochemical Society | Portland Press**

*Please note my normal working days are Monday - Thursday*

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB

Registered address: First Floor 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

---

**From:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk>

**Sent:** Friday, July 26, 2024 9:19 AM

**To:**

**Subject:** Re: Follow up Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

Dear

Thank you for letting me know! And will you use the text we agreed on a while ago?

Best wishes

inke

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke Näthke, FRSE** (she/her/hers)

Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture

Research Integrity Lead

School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee

+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)

PA: Kirsty Forbes | [kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk)

<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>

<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



 [University of Dundee LinkedIn](#)



 [University of Dundee Instagram](#)



 Image

The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

---

**From:**

**Date:** Thursday, 25 July 2024 at 16:32

**To:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <[i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)>

**Subject:** RE: Follow up Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

CAUTION: This email originated from outside the University of Dundee. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender's email address and know the content is safe.

Dear Inke,

Just to keep you updated – we are issuing a retraction for this paper. It is just in the process of being published. I will notify you when the retraction is online.

Best wishes,

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
**Biochemical Society | Portland Press**

*Please note my normal working days are Monday - Thursday*

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB

Registered address: First Floor 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

---

**From:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <[i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)>

**Sent:** Wednesday, July 3, 2024 10:40 AM

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Re: Follow up Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

Dear [REDACTED]

[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED]  
[REDACTED].

When I checked the paper on line it did not appear to have a retraction or note of concern and I wondered where this had got to. Can you please add this to the list of queries from us?

Thank you very much

Best wishes

Inke

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke Näthke, FRSE** (she/her/hers)

Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture

Research Integrity Lead

School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee

+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)

PA: Kirsty Forbes | [kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk)

<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>

<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

---

**From:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <[i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)>

**Date:** Tuesday, 12 December 2023 at 16:29

**To:** [REDACTED]

**Subject:** Follow up Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

Dear [REDACTED],

Dario kindly shared with me your update about taking the retraction forward. I am glad this is now progressing to a conclusion.

Could you please let me know when you plan to publish the retraction? Or maybe you already have and I missed it?

I need to inform the MRC and also would like to make sure that our information is up to date (we keep a record of all our activities and being able to close a file is always helpful)

Thank you for working with us. It was a pleasure even though it is about a difficult situation.

With many good wishes

Inke

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke N athke, FRSE** (she/her/hers)

Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture

School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee

+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)

PA: Kirsty Forbes | [kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk)

<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>

<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

The University of Dundee is a registered Scottish Charity, No: SC015096

The Biochemical Society is a registered charity (No. 253894) and a company limited by guarantee (registered in England and Wales No. 892796). Portland Press Ltd registered in England and Wales No. 2453983.

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB. Registered address: 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE.

VAT registration number GB 523 2392 69.

The contents of this email are for the recipient only.

If you are not this person (or not responsible for delivery to this person), then notify the sender and delete the email immediately.

Any opinions contained in this message are those of the author and are not given or endorsed by the Biochemical Society or the division through which this message is sent unless otherwise clearly indicated in this message.

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB. Registered address: 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

The University of Dundee is a registered Scottish Charity, No: SC015096

---

Automatic reply: Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

---

From [REDACTED]  
Date Mon 16/10/2023 11:37  
To Inke Nathke (Staff) <i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk>

**CAUTION: This email originated from outside the University of Dundee. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender's email address and know the content is safe.**

Thank you for your email. Please note that I am now out of the office on maternity leave. In my absence, please contact [REDACTED] or our Editorial Office (editorial@portlandpress.com).

Kind Regards,  
[REDACTED]

**Biochemical Society | Portland Press**  
**biochemistry.org | portlandpress.com**

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB  
Registered address: First Floor, 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

Follow us on Twitter: [@BiochemSoc](#) | [@PPPublishing](#) | [@Biochem Journal](#) | [@The Biochemist](#)

<http://www.biochemistry.org/>      <http://www.portlandpresspublishing.com/>

The Biochemical Society is a registered charity (No. 253894) and a company limited by guarantee (registered in England and Wales No. 892796). Portland Press Ltd registered in England and Wales No. 2453983.

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB. Registered address: 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE.

VAT registration number GB 523 2392 69.

The contents of this email are for the recipient only.

If you are not this person (or not responsible for delivery to this person), then notify the sender and delete the email immediately.

Any opinions contained in this message are those of the author and are not given or endorsed by the Biochemical Society or the division through which this message is sent unless otherwise clearly indicated in this message.

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB. Registered address: 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

---

Re: Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

---

From Inke Nathke (Staff) <i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk>

Date Mon 16/10/2023 11:37

To [REDACTED]; Dario Alessi (Staff) <d.r.alessi@dundee.ac.uk>

Cc [REDACTED]

Dear [REDACTED]

Apologies for only am getting back to you now. I am currently recovering from surgery and am only just starting to be able to do a little bit of work for the next 5 weeks or so.

[REDACTED]

In response to the other points raised, my view is that whether something has or has not appeared on PubPeer is not relevant. What is relevant is that issues discovered with data in the publication remain questionable. Whether something has been reproduced or not is also not relevant.

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

Another point is that the MRC recommended retraction. It is my understanding that the final decision is yours, as the Journal editors.

I am happy to discuss this further should it be helpful and am also happy to contact the MRC for further input if you think that would be useful.

With many good wishes

Inke

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke Näthke, FRSE** (she/her/hers)  
Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture  
School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee  
+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)  
PA: Kirsty Forbes | [kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk)  
<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>  
<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Date:** Wednesday, 11 October 2023 at 17:21  
**To:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <[i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)>, Dario Alessi (Staff) <[d.r.alessi@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:d.r.alessi@dundee.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Issue related to *Biochem J.* 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

**CAUTION: This email originated from outside the University of Dundee. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender's email address and know the content is safe.**

Dear Professor Nathke and Professor Alessi,

Please accept my sincere apologies for the delay on coming back to you on this case. You are correct that the below proposed retraction text had been approved by Professor Alessi and by the Chair of the *Biochemical Journal*.

'This article is being retracted from the *Biochemical Journal* at the request of the authors, following receipt of a notification from a reader, alerting the authors to figure concerns. The authors willingly supported independent investigations, which have confirmed concerns regarding image duplications in Figures 3B and 5B in the original publication. The authors apologise for inconvenience caused. The Editorial Board agrees with the decision to retract.'



However, the Editorial Office has been contacted separately by the co-corresponding author on this publication, [REDACTED], who has appealed the proposed retraction. I have attached this appeal email for your reference.

Can I please ask you to review this appeal and we can then consider how best to proceed regarding corrective action at the journal.

Please note that I will be on long-term leave from the office as of the end of this week, therefore I have included my colleague [REDACTED] who will be able to support any required corrective action at the journal.

Many thanks,  
[REDACTED]

---

**From:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, September 12, 2023 10:08 AM  
**To:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** Re: Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

Dear [REDACTED]

I wondered if you could please let me know the status of the retraction. My records show that we were happy with the proposed text, Dario has just one small suggestion according to my records

Thank you very much

With best wishes

Inke

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke N athke, FRSE (she/her/hers)**  
Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture  
School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee  
+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)  
PA: Kirsty Forbes | [kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:kforbes002@dundee.ac.uk)  
<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>  
<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

---

**From:** [REDACTED]  
**Date:** Tuesday, 6 June 2023 at 17:27  
**To:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <[i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)>, Dario Alessi (Staff) <[d.ralessi@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:d.ralessi@dundee.ac.uk)>  
**Cc:** [REDACTED]  
**Subject:** RE: Issue related to Biochem J. 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

CAUTION: This email originated from outside the University of Dundee. Do not click links or open attachments unless you recognise the sender's email address and know the content is safe.

Dear Professor Nathke and Professor Alessi,

Thank you for your email informing the *Biochemical Journal* of this post-publication concern, we really do appreciate you sharing the full background on this investigation and for Professor Alessi's own insights.

I can confirm that I have discussed the proposed retraction with the Chair of our *Biochemical Journal* Editorial Board who supports your request.

I can support with taking forward the requested retraction and have proposed some initial draft text for the retraction below. Can I please ask the authors to consider this text and to advise on any preferred edits/additions before this is finalised and taken forward?

This article is being retracted from the *Biochemical Journal* at the request of the authors, following receipt of a notification from a reader, alerting the authors to figure concerns. The authors willingly supported independent investigations, which have confirmed concerns regarding image duplications in Figures 3B and 5B in the original publication. The authors apologise for any inconvenience caused. The Editorial Board agrees with the decision to retract.

Kind Regards,

[REDACTED]

[REDACTED]

**Biochemical Society | Portland Press**  
[biochemistry.org](http://biochemistry.org) | [portlandpress.com](http://portlandpress.com)

Please note my normal working days are Monday–Thursday.

Mailing address: 1 Naoroji Street, London WC1X 0GB  
Registered address: First Floor, 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

Follow us on Twitter: [@BiochemSoc](https://twitter.com/BiochemSoc) | [@PPPublishing](https://twitter.com/PPPublishing) | [@Biochem\\_Journal](https://twitter.com/Biochem_Journal) | [@The\\_Biochemist](https://twitter.com/The_Biochemist)



---

**From:** Inke Nathke (Staff) <[i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, June 6, 2023 12:14 PM  
**To:** [REDACTED]

██████████  
**Subject:** Issue related to *Biochem J.* 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3

Dear ██████████

*I am writing in my role as the Research Integrity Lead in the School of Life Sciences at the University of Dundee to share the letter below from Prof Dario Alessi.*

*Best wishes*

*Inke*

I would like to inform you about an issue related to one of our publications in the *Biochemical Journal* in 2005:

Mora A, Lipina C, Tronche F, Sutherland C, Alessi DR. "Deficiency of PDK1 in liver results in glucose intolerance, impairment of insulin-regulated gene expression and liver failure". *Biochem J.* 2005 Feb 1;385(Pt 3):639-48.3.

The story relating to uncovering this issue started in April 2018, when I became aware of a PubPeer comment suggesting irregularities in one of our publications.

I immediately informed the University of Dundee School of Life Sciences (SLS) Research Integrity Group (RIG) so they could independently investigate this. I provided them with all relevant lab books, autorads and computer files of the publication figures, which had been carefully stored. As the employing organisation at the time the research was conducted the UK Medical Research Council (MRC) was also immediately informed of this situation.

The SLS RIG obtained authorisation from the Dean of SLS to perform a preliminary investigation according to University process. A sub-group of the SLS-RIG undertook the preliminary investigation and found evidence of inappropriate image manipulation in the 2005 *Biochemical Journal* paper.

The sub-group found the following inconsistencies:

- Fig. 3B: Duplications.
- Fig. 5B: Lanes L-DPK1-/- row SK6 total have two contaminating spots, which when flipped overlay identically with the corresponding L-PDK+/+ fasted lanes.
- Fig. 5B: S6K (T389-P) L-PDK+/+ fasted and S6K (T389-P) L-PDK-/- fed are the same blot.

The preliminary investigation was completed in January 2019, and recommended an independent **formal** investigation be undertaken. The Dean of SLS and the University Secretary agreed with this conclusion. Following consultation, it was decided that the investigation should be undertaken by the MRC (as the employing organisation at the time when the research was conducted). In line with due process according to MRC policy, an independent MRC Investigation Panel was appointed and confirmed in July 2021.

This panel conducted a detailed, formal investigation, which included interviews with relevant authors, that was concluded in December 2022. The MRC panel confirmed the findings of the SLS RIG and **recommended that the *Biochemical Journal* publication should be retracted. I would therefore like to request that the publication is retracted as soon as possible.** I would be happy to work with you on a suitable text for the retraction.

We shared this information with all the authors and let them know that we would be sending this information to you. We gave them the opportunity to provide feedback to be included. (Please note we did not have contact details for C. Lipina.)

On a personal note, I would like to share that this situation has been incredibly stressful and difficult. I have always tried to work to the highest standards and my priority from the moment of learning about this possible data manipulation was to ensure that the original data was robustly and independently investigated, and that the truth of what happened was discovered so that lessons can be learned, and the literature be corrected. In hindsight, I should have been more diligent in verifying that all of the final figures in the paper matched the original primary autorad immunoblotting data. In recent years I have made major changes in the way in which our laboratory and Unit operate, and we no longer use autorads for routine immunoblotting and spend much more time discussing and ensuring data integrity. I have also attended courses on data integrity and plan to engage in discussions in this area much more in the future to minimize the possibility of this happening again.

I am truly sorry about what has happened in this publication and am happy to discuss this further.

Best wishes

Dario Alessi

*Please note, I work flexibly and my emails may arrive at non-standard working hours. I completely respect your working pattern and I look forward to a response when you are next working according to your own schedule.*



**Professor Inke Nätke, FRSE** (she/her/hers)

Professor of Epithelial Biology, Associate Dean for Professional Culture

School of Life Sciences, University of Dundee

+44 (0)7976 800993 | [i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:i.s.nathke@dundee.ac.uk)

PA: Carol Urquhart | [c.a.urquhart@dundee.ac.uk](mailto:c.a.urquhart@dundee.ac.uk)

<https://www.dundee.ac.uk/people/inke-nathke>

<http://orcid.org/0000-0003-2420-4385>



The School of Life Sciences are proud recipients of a Silver Athena SWAN award

The University of Dundee is a registered Scottish Charity, No: SC015096

The Biochemical Society is a registered charity (No. 253894) and a company limited by guarantee (registered in England and Wales No. 892796). Portland Press Ltd registered in England and Wales No. 2453983.

Mailing address: 1 Naorji Street, London WC1X 0GB. Registered address: 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE.

VAT registration number GB 523 2392 69.

The contents of this email are for the recipient only.

If you are not this person (or not responsible for delivery to this person), then notify the sender and delete the email immediately.

Any opinions contained in this message are those of the author and are not given or endorsed by the Biochemical Society or the division through which this message is sent unless otherwise clearly indicated in this message.

Mailing address: 1 Naorji Street, London WC1X 0GB. Registered address: 10 Queen Street Place, London EC4R 1BE

The University of Dundee is a registered Scottish Charity, No: SC015096