

To
 Respected Helene Stewart
 Director, Editorial Relations, Web of Science, Clarivate

Subject: Appeal material to be considered in the suppression review

With reference to you email entitled “Potential journal suppression in the upcoming Web of Science Journal Citation Reports” dated May 3, 2023, following issues were raised

Our analysis was performed using the 2022 citation data and revealed citation stacking—a relationship among “donor” publications and “recipient” publications:

- **Bioscience Research** (Innovative Scientific Information & Services Network) is the donor and the recipient is **Genetika-Belgrade** (Serbian Genetics Society)
- 36% of the Journal Impact Factor numerator cites to **Genetika-Belgrade** came from **Bioscience Research**
- 100% of all the citations from **Bioscience Research** to **Genetika-Belgrade** were concentrated in the Journal Impact Factor years of 2021 and 2020

As per your email, our appeal must address the following listed questions. Please find below point to point replies and supported facts

Question	Replies
Define the scholarly relationship between the donor and recipient journals that supports the high volume of citation exchange between the titles.	We have no scholarly or any other relationship with Genetika-Belgrade and never exchanged citations.
Identify any feature of the recipient journal that would so strongly concentrate the citation relationship between the two journals into the content published in 2020 and 2021.	On critical analysis of the provide data, we found that mainly one author i.e. Majid KHAYATNEZHAD from Islamic Azad University Iran cross cited his papers for his personal benefits in papers published by his colleagues from same Iranian university.

Here are few facts about co-authorship of **Majid KHAYATNEZHAD** from **Islamic Azad University Iran**
Fact # 1

Excel sheet ref	GENETIKA, GENETIKA, Vol. 53, No1	2 paper by Majid KHAYATNEZHAD
287-328 42 citations	GENETIKA, Vol. 53, No1,393-405, 2021 MOLECULAR IDENTIFICATION AND GENETIC DIVERSITY IN Hypericum L.: A HIGH VALUE MEDICINAL PLANT USING RAPD MARKERS MARKERS Dezhong BI1,* , Dan CHEN2 , Majid KHAYATNEZHAD3 , Zohreh sayyah HASHJIN4 , Zifa LI2* , Yuexiang MA1 1School of Chinese Medicine, Shandong University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, Jinan, China 2Experimental Centre, Shandong University of Traditional Chinese Medicine, Jinan, China 3Department of Environmental Sciences and Engineering, Ardabil Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ardabil, Iran 4Department of Horticultural Science, Faculty of agriculture, University of Tabriz, Tabriz, Iran	

	<p>GENETIKA-BELGRADE 53 1 349-362 EVALUATION OF GENETIC DIVERSITY IN Geranium (Geraniaceae) USING RAPD MARKER Juan YIN^{1*}, Majid KHAYATNEZHAD², Abdul SHAKOOR^{3,4} ¹Forestry College, Xinyang College of Agriculture and Forestry, Xinyang, Henan, 464000, China ²Department of Environmental Sciences and Engineering, Ardabil Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ardabil, Iran ³College of Environment and Planning, Henan University, Kaifeng, 475004, Henan, China ⁴Key Laboratory of Geospatial Technology for the Middle and Lower Yellow River Regions, Ministry of Education, Kaifeng 475004, Henan, China</p>	
	<p>Genetika, Vol 53, No.2, 559-574. GENETIC DIVERSITY AND RELATIONSHIPS AMONG SALVIA SPECIES BY ISSR MARKERS Zhao YANPENG¹, Wang HONGMEI^{2*}, Liang WEI³, Majid KHAYATNEZHAD⁴ and FAISAL⁵ ¹Department of Fundamental Courses, Shandong University of Science and Technology, Taian, Shandong, China ²Dept. of Physical Education, University of Science and Technology Liaoning, Anshan, China ³Institute of Physical Education, Qingdao University of Science and Technology, Qingdao Shandong 266061, China ⁴Department of Environmental Sciences and Engineering, Ardabil Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ardabil, Iran ⁵ Institute of Plant Sciences, University of Sindh, Jamshoro, Pakistan.</p>	8 citations
	<p>Genetika, Vol 53, No.2, 799-812. GENE FLOW AND POPULATION STRUCTURE IN ALLOCHRUSA (CARYOPHYLLOIDEAE, CARYOPHYLLACEAE) WITH THE USE OF MOLECULAR MARKERS Weimiao CHEN^{1*}, Majid KHAYATNEZHAD²and Nima SARHADI³ ¹College of Chinese Language and Culture, Jinan University,Guangzhou, 510610, China ²Young Researchers Club, Ardabil Branch, Islamic Azad University, Ardabil, Iran ³Ph.D student of Department of Agrotechnology, Faculty of Agriculture, Tarbiat Modares University, Tehran, Iran</p>	

Fact # 2

This is google scholar link of https://scholar.google.com/citations?hl=en&user=Bk-VHmUAAAJ&view_op=list_works&sortby=pubdate of Majid KHAYATNEZHAD from Islamic Azad University Iran you can analyze and check the no of his citation is 737 in 2021 and 940 in 2022 showing a many fold increase in these two years as compare to other years.

Fact # 3

Here in this email I am attaching an excel file in which I highlighted the row no. 287-328 with added columns showing papers of **Majid KHAYATNEZHAD papers published in Genetika** and other papers cited in our journal

Fact # 4

As an example PDF of Bioscience Research paper 610-617-19(1)2022BR22-71 with 37 citations for Khayatnezhad Majid in different papers as co-author

Based on this analysis

We concluded that “

1. One author i.e. **Majid KHAYATNEZHAD** from **Islamic Azad University Iran** cross cited his papers for his personal benefits in papers published by his colleagues from same Iranian university. This is a common authors in all papers published in Genetika citing our journal papers published by his colleagues from same university.
2. This is google scholar link of https://scholar.google.com/citations?hl=en&user=Bk-VHmUAAAAJ&view_op=list_works&sortby=pubdate of Majid KHAYATNEZHAD from Islamic Azad University Iran you can analyze and check the no of his citation is 737 in 2021 and 940 in 2022 showing a many fold increase in these two years as compare to other years.

We requested that our journal suppression from JCR be cancelled based on substantial facts provided above proving no involvement of our journal in this citation stacking. It is our request that our journal be included in JCR as hundreds of authors will be affected due to suppression decision that will be totally unfair.

Submitted for your kind consideration please.

Z. P. Malik
Editorial Incharge