

From: [John Foley](#)
To: [Deric L Wheeler](#)
Cc: [UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer](#)
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.
Date: Sunday, July 25, 2021 5:44:04 PM
Attachments: [Brand et al. Retraction Draft.docx](#)

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your message. I apologize for the delay in getting back to you.

I am attaching a draft of the retraction notice. I'm happy to consider any edits that you or Brian may have, although I may need to modify slightly as per journal style. It would be helpful if you could make any edits or corrections visible using the Tracked Changes functionality in Word. The text related to me confirming that all authors are on board with the Retraction assumes that everyone will be (we will write to all authors independently asking for confirmation). If we don't get a consensus for any reason, we will simply note which authors do not agree, but I hope it doesn't come to that. I've tried to be as transparent as possible about what the problems with the paper were, as well as about the findings of the investigation committee.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns. I look forward to hearing from you soon.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Sunday, July 18, 2021 3:01 PM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you for your patience. I was wondering if you could craft up a first draft of the retraction for me to take a look at.

Thank you for guiding me through this process.

Warm regards,
Deric

Deric L Wheeler, PhD
Professor
Carbone Cancer Center
School of Medicine and Public Health

608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:49 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Brian,

Thanks for your input, and sorry for being late to reply.

As I discussed with Deric on the phone, I am very happy to work together with you, Deric, and ORI to draft, edit, and finalize any text before publication so that the reasons for the retraction (assuming that's the route taken) are as transparent and as helpful to readers as possible.

Best wishes,
John

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 4:21 PM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>; John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thanks, we are thinking the same. It would be complicated to act without some guidance from ORI. Hopefully we can get that soon.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:18 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox

Of course not. I always value your offices input. We discussed an editor-senior author retraction given the depth of the carelessness. Should we choose this route, Dr. Foley said he would help in crafting the retraction integrating the conclusions of the investigation and my desire to exhibit the highest ethical standard coupled to the integrity of the scientific literature.

Thanks

Deric.

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 3:12 PM

To: Deric L Wheeler; John Foley

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thank you Deric, I hope your crystallization doesn't flash before ORI has had a chance to weigh in.

I contacted them this morning to set up a call.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:01 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox,

Thanks for your quick response. I was able to jump on the phone with Dr. Foley this afternoon and discuss some paths forward.

Very happy to fill you in as things crystallize more.

Warm regards,

D

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 1:13 PM
To: John Foley; Deric L Wheeler
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello everyone, I would be able to participate in a call on Thursday after 3:00 pm, not available before that.

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 11:26 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your email and your positive response.
I am free of meetings for the rest of the day today. I am based in Washington DC, so the following times are local. On Wednesday, I am free from 3:00 PM onwards; on Thursday, from 2:00 PM onwards; Friday is not a great day.
My cell phone is [REDACTED]

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 6:10 AM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you so much for reaching out. I have been hoping to hear from you. Also, thank you for circling in the UW Madison RIO, it is greatly appreciated. I was wondering if you and I could connect via phone for 10-15 minutes to discuss this topic and steps forward. If you could give me a few times that would work for you we can find a few minutes to chat.

I look forward to working with you and bringing this to a conclusion.

Warmest regards,
Deric

Deric L. Wheeler, PhD
Professor
University of Wisconsin
School of Medicine and Public Health
Carbone Cancer Center
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 12:22 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Wheeler,

I hope that this message finds you well.

I am contacting you with regards to your paper by Brand *et al.* entitled “The receptor tyrosine kinase AXL mediates nuclear translocation of the epidermal growth factor receptor,” which was published by *Science Signaling* in our issue of 3 January 2017 (<https://stke.sciencemag.org/content/10/460/eaag1064>).

As you are well aware, this paper was the subject of an investigation by the Office of the Vice Chancellor for Research and Graduate Education, whose findings were forwarded to me in August of 2018 by the Research Integrity Officer, Dr. Brian Fox.

The findings of this investigation were that various data in Figures 1, 2, 4, 5, and 6, as well as in figs. S2 and S4 were duplicated, mislabeled, or had other anomalies. The committee found that these issues were due to carelessness and lack of attention to detail rather than through any intent to deceive, and so they concluded that no research misconduct was committed. However, the published record still needs to be corrected.

Despite my egregious delay in handling this situation, I am writing to you to let you know that I am starting the process of correcting the record by whatever means I find most appropriate, be that through an Erratum or a Retraction. The report detailed that the original data were found in many

cases, so it is conceivable that these data might be used to replace the incorrect data in the original publication in the form of an Erratum. However, the report also states that in some cases, the original data were not available. Whereas in those cases, the Inquiry Committee members were satisfied that these issues did not affect the overall conclusions of the study, the lack of such data presents very serious problems when it comes to correcting the publication record. An inability to replace the incorrect data in the original paper would have more serious consequences.

As a starting point, I am reaching out to ask whether any of the missing data have been found since the investigation was concluded. I would appreciate a response at your earliest convenience.

I have copied Associate Vice Chancellor Brian Fox on this email to make him aware of my intentions to correct the publication record.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,
John

John F. Foley, Ph.D.,
Editor, *Science Signaling*
stke.sciencemag.org
@foleyjf

From: [John Foley](#)
To: [Deric L Wheeler](#)
Cc: [UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer](#)
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.
Date: Sunday, July 25, 2021 6:19:03 PM

Dear Deric,

That would be extremely helpful, thanks.

Best,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Sunday, July 25, 2021 7:18 PM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Dear John,

Thank you very much for this draft. Would you like me to collect the emails of each individual so you may contact them? the vast majority are (were) undergraduates in my laboratory. Ravi Salgia and Randy Kimple have been alerted and in agreement with this step forward. I need to let Jana Rolff know.

Thanks again,
Deric

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Sent: Sunday, July 25, 2021 5:43:59 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your message. I apologize for the delay in getting back to you.

I am attaching a draft of the retraction notice. I'm happy to consider any edits that you or Brian may have, although I may need to modify slightly as per journal style. It would be helpful if you could make any edits or corrections visible using the Tracked Changes functionality in Word. The text related to me confirming that all authors are on board with the Retraction assumes that everyone

will be (we will write to all authors independently asking for confirmation). If we don't get a consensus for any reason, we will simply note which authors do not agree, but I hope it doesn't come to that. I've tried to be as transparent as possible about what the problems with the paper were, as well as about the findings of the investigation committee.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns. I look forward to hearing from you soon.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Sunday, July 18, 2021 3:01 PM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you for your patience. I was wondering if you could craft up a first draft of the retraction for me to take a look at.

Thank you for guiding me through this process.

Warm regards,
Deric

Deric L Wheeler, PhD
Professor
Carbone Cancer Center
School of Medicine and Public Health
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:49 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Brian,

Thanks for your input, and sorry for being late to reply.
As I discussed with Deric on the phone, I am very happy to work together with you, Deric, and ORI to

draft, edit, and finalize any text before publication so that the reasons for the retraction (assuming that's the route taken) are as transparent and as helpful to readers as possible.

Best wishes,
John

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 4:21 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>; John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thanks, we are thinking the same. It would be complicated to act without some guidance from ORI. Hopefully we can get that soon.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:18 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox

Of course not. I always value your offices input. We discussed an editor-senior author retraction given the depth of the carelessness. Should we choose this route, Dr. Foley said he would help in crafting the retraction integrating the conclusions of the investigation and my desire to exhibit the highest ethical standard coupled to the integrity of the scientific literature.

Thanks

Deric.

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 3:12 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler; John Foley
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thank you Deric, I hope your crystallization doesn't flash before ORI has had a chance to weigh in.

I contacted them this morning to set up a call.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:01 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox,
Thanks for your quick response. I was able to jump on the phone with Dr. Foley this afternoon and discuss some paths forward.

Very happy to fill you in as things crystallize more.

Warm regards,

D

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 1:13 PM
To: John Foley; Deric L Wheeler
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello everyone, I would be able to participate in a call on Thursday after 3:00 pm, not available before that.

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 11:26 AM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your email and your positive response.

I am free of meetings for the rest of the day today. I am based in Washington DC, so the following times are local. On Wednesday, I am free from 3:00 PM onwards; on Thursday, from 2:00 PM onwards; Friday is not a great day.

My cell phone is [REDACTED]

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 6:10 AM

To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you so much for reaching out. I have been hoping to hear from you. Also, thank you for circling in the UW Madison RIO, it is greatly appreciated. I was wondering if you and I could connect via phone for 10-15 minutes to discuss this topic and steps forward. If you could give me a few times that would work for you we can find a few minutes to chat.

I look forward to working with you and bringing this to a conclusion.

Warmest regards,
Deric

Deric L. Wheeler, PhD
Professor
University of Wisconsin
School of Medicine and Public Health
Carbone Cancer Center

608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 12:22 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Wheeler,

I hope that this message finds you well.

I am contacting you with regards to your paper by Brand *et al.* entitled “The receptor tyrosine kinase AXL mediates nuclear translocation of the epidermal growth factor receptor,” which was published by *Science Signaling* in our issue of 3 January 2017 (<https://stke.sciencemag.org/content/10/460/eaag1064>).

As you are well aware, this paper was the subject of an investigation by the Office of the Vice Chancellor for Research and Graduate Education, whose findings were forwarded to me in August of 2018 by the Research Integrity Officer, Dr. Brian Fox.

The findings of this investigation were that various data in Figures 1, 2, 4, 5, and 6, as well as in figs. S2 and S4 were duplicated, mislabeled, or had other anomalies. The committee found that these issues were due to carelessness and lack of attention to detail rather than through any intent to deceive, and so they concluded that no research misconduct was committed. However, the published record still needs to be corrected.

Despite my egregious delay in handling this situation, I am writing to you to let you know that I am starting the process of correcting the record by whatever means I find most appropriate, be that through an Erratum or a Retraction. The report detailed that the original data were found in many cases, so it is conceivable that these data might be used to replace the incorrect data in the original publication in the form of an Erratum. However, the report also states that in some cases, the original data were not available. Whereas in those cases, the Inquiry Committee members were satisfied that these issues did not affect the overall conclusions of the study, the lack of such data presents very serious problems when it comes to correcting the publication record. An inability to replace the incorrect data in the original paper would have more serious consequences.

As a starting point, I am reaching out to ask whether any of the missing data have been found since the investigation was concluded. I would appreciate a response at your earliest convenience.

I have copied Associate Vice Chancellor Brian Fox on this email to make him aware of my intentions to correct the publication record.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,
John

John F. Foley, Ph.D.,
Editor, *Science Signaling*
stke.sciencemag.org
[@foleyjf](https://twitter.com/foleyjf)

From: [Deric L Wheeler](#)
To: [John Foley](#)
Cc: [UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer](#)
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.
Date: Monday, July 26, 2021 10:58:50 AM
Attachments: [Brand et al. Retraction Draft DLW.docx](#)

Dear John,
Please find attached potential edits to your original.

Warmest regards,
Deric

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Sunday, July 25, 2021 at 5:44 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your message. I apologize for the delay in getting back to you.

I am attaching a draft of the retraction notice. I'm happy to consider any edits that you or Brian may have, although I may need to modify slightly as per journal style. It would be helpful if you could make any edits or corrections visible using the Tracked Changes functionality in Word. The text related to me confirming that all authors are on board with the Retraction assumes that everyone will be (we will write to all authors independently asking for confirmation). If we don't get a consensus for any reason, we will simply note which authors do not agree, but I hope it doesn't come to that. I've tried to be as transparent as possible about what the problems with the paper were, as well as about the findings of the investigation committee.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns. I look forward to hearing from you soon.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Sunday, July 18, 2021 3:01 PM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you for your patience. I was wondering if you could craft up a first draft of the retraction for me to take a look at.

Thank you for guiding me through this process.

Warm regards,
Deric

Deric L Wheeler, PhD
Professor
Carbone Cancer Center
School of Medicine and Public Health
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:49 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Brian,

Thanks for your input, and sorry for being late to reply.
As I discussed with Deric on the phone, I am very happy to work together with you, Deric, and ORI to draft, edit, and finalize any text before publication so that the reasons for the retraction (assuming that's the route taken) are as transparent and as helpful to readers as possible.

Best wishes,
John

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 4:21 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>; John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thanks, we are thinking the same. It would be complicated to act without some guidance from ORI. Hopefully we can get that soon.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:18 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox

Of course not. I always value your offices input. We discussed an editor-senior author retraction given the depth of the carelessness. Should we choose this route, Dr. Foley said he would help in crafting the retraction integrating the conclusions of the investigation and my desire to exhibit the highest ethical standard coupled to the integrity of the scientific literature.

Thanks

Deric.

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 3:12 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler; John Foley
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thank you Deric, I hope your crystallization doesn't flash before ORI has had a chance to weigh in.

I contacted them this morning to set up a call.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:01 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox,

Thanks for your quick response. I was able to jump on the phone with Dr. Foley this afternoon and discuss some paths forward.

Very happy to fill you in as things crystallize more.

Warm regards,

D

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 1:13 PM
To: John Foley; Deric L Wheeler
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello everyone, I would be able to participate in a call on Thursday after 3:00 pm, not available before that.

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 11:26 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your email and your positive response.

I am free of meetings for the rest of the day today. I am based in Washington DC, so the following times are local. On Wednesday, I am free from 3:00 PM onwards; on Thursday, from 2:00 PM onwards; Friday is not a great day.

My cell phone is [REDACTED]

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 6:10 AM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you so much for reaching out. I have been hoping to hear from you. Also, thank you for circling in the UW Madison RIO, it is greatly appreciated. I was wondering if you and I could connect via phone for 10-15 minutes to discuss this topic and steps forward. If you could give me a few times that would work for you we can find a few minutes to chat.

I look forward to working with you and bringing this to a conclusion.

Warmest regards,
Deric

Deric L. Wheeler, PhD
Professor
University of Wisconsin
School of Medicine and Public Health
Carbone Cancer Center
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 12:22 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Wheeler,

I hope that this message finds you well.

I am contacting you with regards to your paper by Brand *et al.* entitled "The receptor tyrosine kinase AXL mediates nuclear translocation of the epidermal growth factor receptor," which was published by *Science Signaling* in our issue of 3 January 2017

<https://stke.sciencemag.org/content/10/460/eaag1064>).

As you are well aware, this paper was the subject of an investigation by the Office of the Vice Chancellor for Research and Graduate Education, whose findings were forwarded to me in August of 2018 by the Research Integrity Officer, Dr. Brian Fox.

The findings of this investigation were that various data in Figures 1, 2, 4, 5, and 6, as well as in figs. S2 and S4 were duplicated, mislabeled, or had other anomalies. The committee found that these issues were due to carelessness and lack of attention to detail rather than through any intent to deceive, and so they concluded that no research misconduct was committed. However, the published record still needs to be corrected.

Despite my egregious delay in handling this situation, I am writing to you to let you know that I am starting the process of correcting the record by whatever means I find most appropriate, be that through an Erratum or a Retraction. The report detailed that the original data were found in many cases, so it is conceivable that these data might be used to replace the incorrect data in the original publication in the form of an Erratum. However, the report also states that in some cases, the original data were not available. Whereas in those cases, the Inquiry Committee members were satisfied that these issues did not affect the overall conclusions of the study, the lack of such data presents very serious problems when it comes to correcting the publication record. An inability to replace the incorrect data in the original paper would have more serious consequences.

As a starting point, I am reaching out to ask whether any of the missing data have been found since the investigation was concluded. I would appreciate a response at your earliest convenience.

I have copied Associate Vice Chancellor Brian Fox on this email to make him aware of my intentions to correct the publication record.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,

John

John F. Foley, Ph.D.,
Editor, *Science Signaling*
stke.sciencemag.org
@foleyjf

From: [Deric L Wheeler](#)
To: [UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer](#); [John Foley](#)
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.
Date: Wednesday, July 28, 2021 7:15:12 AM

Thank you Dr. Fox,

Deric

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Date: Tuesday, July 27, 2021 at 2:40 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello Deric and John,

I am just back from vacation and reviewed your statement. I feel this is the correct action to take, reflecting the direction of my discussions with ORI just before I left.

Thank you for sharing the draft, I have no revisions to suggest.

Best wishes,

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Monday, July 26, 2021 at 10:58 AM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear John,
Please find attached potential edits to your original.

Warmest regards,
Deric

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Sunday, July 25, 2021 at 5:44 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your message. I apologize for the delay in getting back to you.

I am attaching a draft of the retraction notice. I'm happy to consider any edits that you or Brian may have, although I may need to modify slightly as per journal style. It would be helpful if you could make any edits or corrections visible using the Tracked Changes functionality in Word. The text related to me confirming that all authors are on board with the Retraction assumes that everyone will be (we will write to all authors independently asking for confirmation). If we don't get a consensus for any reason, we will simply note which authors do not agree, but I hope it doesn't come to that. I've tried to be as transparent as possible about what the problems with the paper were, as well as about the findings of the investigation committee.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns. I look forward to hearing from you soon.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Sent: Sunday, July 18, 2021 3:01 PM

To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you for your patience. I was wondering if you could craft up a first draft of the retraction for me to take a look at.

Thank you for guiding me through this process.

Warm regards,
Deric

Deric L Wheeler, PhD
Professor
Carbone Cancer Center
School of Medicine and Public Health
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:49 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Brian,

Thanks for your input, and sorry for being late to reply.

As I discussed with Deric on the phone, I am very happy to work together with you, Deric, and ORI to draft, edit, and finalize any text before publication so that the reasons for the retraction (assuming that's the route taken) are as transparent and as helpful to readers as possible.

Best wishes,
John

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 4:21 PM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>; John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thanks, we are thinking the same. It would be complicated to act without some guidance from ORI. Hopefully we can get that soon.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:18 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox

Of course not. I always value your offices input. We discussed an editor-senior author retraction given the depth of the carelessness. Should we choose this route, Dr. Foley said he would help in crafting the retraction integrating the conclusions of the investigation and my desire to exhibit the highest ethical standard coupled to the integrity of the scientific literature.

Thanks

Deric.

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.

Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 3:12 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler; John Foley
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thank you Deric, I hope your crystallization doesn't flash before ORI has had a chance to weigh in.

I contacted them this morning to set up a call.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:01 PM
To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox,

Thanks for your quick response. I was able to jump on the phone with Dr. Foley this afternoon and discuss some paths forward.

Very happy to fill you in as things crystallize more.

Warm regards,

D

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 1:13 PM
To: John Foley; Deric L Wheeler

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello everyone, I would be able to participate in a call on Thursday after 3:00 pm, not available before that.

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 11:26 AM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your email and your positive response.

I am free of meetings for the rest of the day today. I am based in Washington DC, so the following times are local. On Wednesday, I am free from 3:00 PM onwards; on Thursday, from 2:00 PM onwards; Friday is not a great day.

My cell phone is [REDACTED]

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 6:10 AM

To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you so much for reaching out. I have been hoping to hear from you. Also, thank you for circling in the UW Madison RIO, it is greatly appreciated. I was wondering if you and I could connect via phone for 10-15 minutes to discuss this topic and steps forward. If you could give me a few times that would work for you we can find a few minutes to chat.

I look forward to working with you and bringing this to a conclusion.

Warmest regards,
Deric

Deric L. Wheeler, PhD
Professor
University of Wisconsin
School of Medicine and Public Health
Carbone Cancer Center
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 12:22 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Wheeler,

I hope that this message finds you well.

I am contacting you with regards to your paper by Brand *et al.* entitled "The receptor tyrosine kinase AXL mediates nuclear translocation of the epidermal growth factor receptor," which was published by *Science Signaling* in our issue of 3 January 2017 (<https://stke.sciencemag.org/content/10/460/eaag1064>).

As you are well aware, this paper was the subject of an investigation by the Office of the Vice Chancellor for Research and Graduate Education, whose findings were forwarded to me in August of 2018 by the Research Integrity Officer, Dr. Brian Fox.

The findings of this investigation were that various data in Figures 1, 2, 4, 5, and 6, as well as in figs. S2 and S4 were duplicated, mislabeled, or had other anomalies. The committee found that these issues were due to carelessness and lack of attention to detail rather than through any intent to deceive, and so they concluded that no research misconduct was committed. However, the published record still needs to be corrected.

Despite my egregious delay in handling this situation, I am writing to you to let you know that I am starting the process of correcting the record by whatever means I find most appropriate, be that through an Erratum or a Retraction. The report detailed that the original data were found in many cases, so it is conceivable that these data might be used to replace the incorrect data in the original publication in the form of an Erratum. However, the report also states that in some cases, the original data were not available. Whereas in those cases, the Inquiry Committee members were

satisfied that these issues did not affect the overall conclusions of the study, the lack of such data presents very serious problems when it comes to correcting the publication record. An inability to replace the incorrect data in the original paper would have more serious consequences.

As a starting point, I am reaching out to ask whether any of the missing data have been found since the investigation was concluded. I would appreciate a response at your earliest convenience.

I have copied Associate Vice Chancellor Brian Fox on this email to make him aware of my intentions to correct the publication record.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,
John

John F. Foley, Ph.D.,
Editor, *Science Signaling*
stke.sciencemag.org
@foleyjf

From: [John Foley](#)
To: [UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer](#)
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.
Date: Wednesday, July 28, 2021 10:22:56 AM

Dear Brian,

Thanks for reviewing the text. I appreciate your comments.

Best wishes,
John

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 27, 2021 3:40 PM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>; John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello Deric and John,

I am just back from vacation and reviewed your statement. I feel this is the correct action to take, reflecting the direction of my discussions with ORI just before I left.

Thank you for sharing the draft, I have no revisions to suggest.

Best wishes,

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Monday, July 26, 2021 at 10:58 AM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear John,
Please find attached potential edits to your original.

Warmest regards,
Deric

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Date: Sunday, July 25, 2021 at 5:44 PM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your message. I apologize for the delay in getting back to you.

I am attaching a draft of the retraction notice. I'm happy to consider any edits that you or Brian may have, although I may need to modify slightly as per journal style. It would be helpful if you could make any edits or corrections visible using the Tracked Changes functionality in Word. The text related to me confirming that all authors are on board with the Retraction assumes that everyone will be (we will write to all authors independently asking for confirmation). If we don't get a consensus for any reason, we will simply note which authors do not agree, but I hope it doesn't come to that. I've tried to be as transparent as possible about what the problems with the paper were, as well as about the findings of the investigation committee.

Please let me know if you have any questions or concerns. I look forward to hearing from you soon.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Sent: Sunday, July 18, 2021 3:01 PM

To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you for your patience. I was wondering if you could craft up a first draft of the retraction for me to take a look at.

Thank you for guiding me through this process.

Warm regards,
Deric

Deric L Wheeler, PhD
Professor
Carbone Cancer Center
School of Medicine and Public Health

608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:49 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Brian,

Thanks for your input, and sorry for being late to reply.

As I discussed with Deric on the phone, I am very happy to work together with you, Deric, and ORI to draft, edit, and finalize any text before publication so that the reasons for the retraction (assuming that's the route taken) are as transparent and as helpful to readers as possible.

Best wishes,
John

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 4:21 PM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>; John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thanks, we are thinking the same. It would be complicated to act without some guidance from ORI. Hopefully we can get that soon.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:18 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox

Of course not. I always value your offices input. We discussed an editor-senior author retraction given the depth of the carelessness. Should we choose this route, Dr. Foley said he would help in crafting the retraction integrating the conclusions of the investigation and my desire to exhibit the highest ethical standard coupled to the integrity of the scientific literature.

Thanks

Deric.

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>

Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 3:12 PM

To: Deric L Wheeler; John Foley

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Thank you Deric, I hope your crystallization doesn't flash before ORI has had a chance to weigh in.

I contacted them this morning to set up a call.

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 3:01 PM

To: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>, John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>

Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Fox,

Thanks for your quick response. I was able to jump on the phone with Dr. Foley this afternoon and discuss some paths forward.

Very happy to fill you in as things crystallize more.

Warm regards,

D

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
School of Medicine and Public Health
University of Wisconsin
Madison, WI 53705

From: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 1:13 PM
To: John Foley; Deric L Wheeler
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Hello everyone, I would be able to participate in a call on Thursday after 3:00 pm, not available before that.

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 11:26 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: RE: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Deric,

Thanks for your email and your positive response.
I am free of meetings for the rest of the day today. I am based in Washington DC, so the following times are local. On Wednesday, I am free from 3:00 PM onwards; on Thursday, from 2:00 PM onwards; Friday is not a great day.
My cell phone is [REDACTED]

I look forward to hearing from you.

Best wishes,
John

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Sent: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 6:10 AM
To: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Re: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

[EXTERNAL EMAIL]

Thank you so much for reaching out. I have been hoping to hear from you. Also, thank you for circling in the UW Madison RIO, it is greatly appreciated. I was wondering if you and I could connect via phone for 10-15 minutes to discuss this topic and steps forward. If you could give me a few times that would work for you we can find a few minutes to chat.

I look forward to working with you and bringing this to a conclusion.

Warmest regards,
Deric

Deric L. Wheeler, PhD
Professor
University of Wisconsin
School of Medicine and Public Health
Carbone Cancer Center
608-262-7837

From: John Foley <jfoley@aaas.org>
Date: Tuesday, July 6, 2021 at 12:22 AM
To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Cc: UW-Madison Research Integrity Officer <rio@research.wisc.edu>
Subject: Your Science Signaling paper aag1064 by Brand et al.

Dear Dr. Wheeler,

I hope that this message finds you well.

I am contacting you with regards to your paper by Brand *et al.* entitled “The receptor tyrosine kinase AXL mediates nuclear translocation of the epidermal growth factor receptor,” which was published by *Science Signaling* in our issue of 3 January 2017 (<https://stke.sciencemag.org/content/10/460/eaag1064>).

As you are well aware, this paper was the subject of an investigation by the Office of the Vice Chancellor for Research and Graduate Education, whose findings were forwarded to me in August of 2018 by the Research Integrity Officer, Dr. Brian Fox.

The findings of this investigation were that various data in Figures 1, 2, 4, 5, and 6, as well as in figs. S2 and S4 were duplicated, mislabeled, or had other anomalies. The committee found that these issues were due to carelessness and lack of attention to detail rather than through any intent to deceive, and so they concluded that no research misconduct was committed. However, the published record still needs to be corrected.

Despite my egregious delay in handling this situation, I am writing to you to let you know that I am starting the process of correcting the record by whatever means I find most appropriate, be that through an Erratum or a Retraction. The report detailed that the original data were found in many

cases, so it is conceivable that these data might be used to replace the incorrect data in the original publication in the form of an Erratum. However, the report also states that in some cases, the original data were not available. Whereas in those cases, the Inquiry Committee members were satisfied that these issues did not affect the overall conclusions of the study, the lack of such data presents very serious problems when it comes to correcting the publication record. An inability to replace the incorrect data in the original paper would have more serious consequences.

As a starting point, I am reaching out to ask whether any of the missing data have been found since the investigation was concluded. I would appreciate a response at your earliest convenience.

I have copied Associate Vice Chancellor Brian Fox on this email to make him aware of my intentions to correct the publication record.

Thank you for your assistance in this matter.

Sincerely,
John

John F. Foley, Ph.D.,
Editor, *Science Signaling*
stke.sciencemag.org
@foleyjf

From: BRIAN G FOX
To: [REDACTED]
Subject: Re: [REDACTED]
Date: Wednesday, December 29, 2021 12:19:25 PM

[REDACTED]

Brian

From: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>
Date: Wednesday, November 10, 2021 at 8:24 AM
To: BRIAN G FOX <bgfox@biochem.wisc.edu>
Subject: Fwd: query from Retraction Watch

Dr. Fox

Our science signaling was retracted yesterday. I received this email. I am guessing I should do nothing, but wanted to follow your policies. I think we have the right to refuse disseminating any information.

Please advise.

Warm regards

Deric

Deric L. Wheeler, Ph.D.

Professor

Carbone Cancer Center

School of Medicine and Public Health

University of Wisconsin

Madison, WI 53705

From: adam.marcus1@gmail.com <adam.marcus1@gmail.com>

Sent: Wednesday, November 10, 2021 7:44:27 AM

To: Deric L Wheeler <dlwheeler@wisc.edu>

Subject: query from Retraction Watch

Dr. Wheeler -- I am writing a post about the retraction of your paper in Science Signaling:

<https://www.science.org/doi/10.1126/scisignal.abn0168>

I was wondering if you could tell us who was responsible for preparing the figures in question, and whether, as a result of this matter you've changed any of your lab protocols to avoid similar issues in the future.

Also, I was hoping you might be able to send us a copy of the UW report on the case.

Regards,

Adam

--

Adam Marcus

co-founder,

Retraction Watch (retractionwatch.com) and the Center for Scientific Integrity
Managing Editor,
Gastroenterology & Endoscopy News (gastroendonews.com)