



CONFIDENTIAL/SENSITIVE

January 29, 2019

Ms. Etta Kavanagh  
Editorial Manager  
PNAS  
[EKavanagh@nas.edu](mailto:EKavanagh@nas.edu)

**RE: RETRACTION REQUEST [REDACTED] 2016 PNAS 113:E3139-E3202**

Dear Ms. Kavanagh:

As noted in my email dated December 3, 2018, the Ohio State University has completed its investigation of allegations of possible Research Misconduct relating to [REDACTED], 2016, PNAS 113:E3139-E3202. The University determined that data and text for Figures 3 and S4A regarding the acquisition, identification, characterization, and reporting of Ivy arabinogalactan protein (*IAGP*) were intentionally falsified [REDACTED] and then intentionally and recklessly misreported in the manuscript [REDACTED] M. Zhang). As these actions constitute Research Misconduct, the University is requesting that the manuscript be retracted and that the sequences deposited in GenBank for *IAGP* (KM820289, KF752597, AKN58855) be withdrawn. The University does not believe that correction of the article would be appropriate or scientifically valid.

To date, Dr. Zhang has not provided to the University any additional data or any records supporting the information that was provided to you for the proposed correction, and we cannot validate, nor verify the accuracy or authenticity of any of those data. Further, the new sequence information provided to PNAS for the correction does not identify a new replacement sequence for the previously published *IAGP*, but rather provides six (6) new candidate proteins based on tryptic peptide hits. This does not correct the scientific record and the relevancy of these new candidates is questionable.

We understand that the final decision on whether or not to retract or correct the manuscript ultimately resides with the journal, but we strongly suggest that retraction is the appropriate course of action. If the journal does decide to allow for a correction, please also note that the University did identify a number of other errors in the text, including misrepresentation of the materials and methods described for the mass spectrometry data presented in Figure S4B.

Due to confidentiality requirements, we are limited in what information we can provide regarding this matter, but we will work with you if there are specific questions or information that would be helpful. Please contact me at 614-247-8831 or [yucel.4@osu.edu](mailto:yucel.4@osu.edu), if you require additional information or materials concerning this matter.



**THE OHIO STATE UNIVERSITY**

---

Sincerely,

Jennifer K. Yucel, Ph.D.  
Associate Vice President, Office of Research Compliance  
Research Integrity Officer

CC: Office of Legal Affairs