

STRICTLY PRIVATE AND CONFIDENTIAL

Ms Claire Francis
Sent by email to

31 October 2019

Dear Ms Francis

RE: Initial investigation under King's College London's *Procedure for Investigating and Resolving Allegations of Research Misconduct* (the 'Procedure') – Outcome of the investigation into allegations against Professors Farzin Farzaneh and Ghulam Mufti

Further to your concerns about potential research misconduct on the part of Professors Farzin Farzaneh and Gulam Mufti that were brought to the attention of King's College London on 2 and 10 January 2019, I am writing to inform you that the initial investigation stage has now concluded and to provide a summary of the outcome.

In line with the Procedure, I convened a small panel of independent and senior members of academic staff (the 'Panel') to clarify the allegations where necessary, determine whether the allegations had been made in good faith, assess whether a *prima facie* case of misconduct had been established and, if so, the level of its seriousness. The Panel assessed each allegation in turn, taking into account the evidence provided by the respondents for each.

The Panel found that all but three allegations brought to light were of substance and that, in each case, the respondents had no intention to deceive and the allegation was of a nature that can be remedied.

In these instances, the Panel determined that there is clear evidence of poor practice in research, but that the findings did not constitute research misconduct. The Panel concluded therefore, in relation to these allegations, no further action should be taken under the Procedure.

Three of the allegations referred to the College were deemed to be unfounded, as there was insufficient evidence to support them.

The Panel has requested that Professors Farzaneh and Mufti provide notices of correction, publish errata, and/or provide amended figures to the following scientific journals: *Molecular Therapy*, *Blood*, *Haematologica*, *Molecular and Cellular Biology*, and *Molecular Cancer Research*.

This investigation under the Procedure is now closed. Thank you for taking the time to bring your concerns to our attention and for treating this matter with discretion and confidentiality.

I would be grateful if you could acknowledge receipt of this letter to Natasha Awais-Dean. If you have any queries relating to this matter or the operation of the Procedure, please direct these to Natasha Awais-Dean in the first instance, who can be contacted at _____ or on _____.

Yours sincerely

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'T Newton'.

Professor Tim Newton
Dean of Research Governance, Ethics and Integrity