

**From:** Iain Martin iain.martin@unsw.edu.au  
**Subject:** Re: Concern of possible case of misconduct at UNSW  
**Date:** 11 December 2013 at 1:58 pm  
**To:** David Vaux vaux@wehi.edu.au  
**Cc:** Indelle Scott i.scott@unsw.edu.au



Dear David

Thank you for your email and I am sorry for the delay in responding.

I can confirm that an inquiry panel has been constituted to consider this matter. I acknowledge that it has taken a significant amount of time to progress this matter to this stage. Whilst I hope you understand why I cannot go into details of the process to date, a number of matters arising during the course of this process have made this more complex than usual.

The panel has now scheduled its initial meetings. Now that the panel has been established with set terms of reference the details of their operation is a matter for the panel themselves. They have the ability to invite witnesses and until the matter is concluded I will not be aware of the details of the process.

All of the relevant evidence, including available original data has been secured.

Our policy indicates that UNSW may contact stakeholders. Stakeholders include the Journal (JBC), funders of the research work (NHMRC and Cancer Council), the head of the clinical trial, sponsors of the clinical trial, ethics committee in control of the trial etc

UNSW made the conscious and considered decision to maintain confidentiality and not to notify the Journal at this stage of proceedings.

I fully understand your desire to see the investigation of this matter reach a conclusion, something we share, but at the same time we have ensure that nothing predetermines or prejudices the outcome of the process.

Regards

Iain Martin

---

\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_

---

\_\_\_\_\_

|

---

**From:** David Vaux <[vaux@wehi.EDU.AU](mailto:vaux@wehi.EDU.AU)>  
**Date:** Wednesday, 13 November 2013 12:52 pm  
**To:** Iain Martin <[iain.martin@unsw.edu.au](mailto:iain.martin@unsw.edu.au)>  
**Cc:** Les Field <[l.field@unsw.edu.au](mailto:l.field@unsw.edu.au)>, Indelle Scott <[i.scott@unsw.edu.au](mailto:i.scott@unsw.edu.au)>  
**Subject:** Re: Concern of possible case of misconduct at UNSW

Dear Professor Martin,

As you know, I wrote to you and Professor Field on 14 February 2103 raising concerns of possible research misconduct at UNSW.

As 9 months have now passed since I first wrote to you, I am writing again to ask if you have made any progress.

Specifically, has an inquiry panel been formed?

Have they collected and secured all the relevant evidence?

Have hearings commenced?

Will I be called on as a witness (I am happy to do so)?

I note that the authors have published a correction in the JBC of the paper that contained the duplicated images (that the authors now acknowledge to have been "incorrect".)  
<<http://www.jbc.org/content/288/44/31918.full>>

Had the JBC been informed, in accordance with section 8.1.2 of the UNSW Procedure for Handling Allegations of Research Misconduct, that a *prima facie* case for research misconduct involving this paper had been found (24 June 2013)?

If not, could you please write to the Editors of the JBC and inform them that this paper is under investigation? (The JBC/ASBMB Manager of Publication Ethics is Patricia Valdez <[pvaldez@asbmb.org](mailto:pvaldez@asbmb.org)>)

Could you also please acknowledge receipt of this message?

Yours sincerely,

David Vaux

---