

**Subject:** concern about research misconduct

**Date:** Tuesday, October 18, 2016 at 9:05:11 PM Eastern Daylight Time

**From:** Samir S. Soneji

**To:** Martin N. Wybourne, Leslie P. Henderson, Elliott S. Fisher, Adam M. Keller

Professor Wybourne,

My name is Samir Soneji and I am an assistant professor at The Dartmouth Institute for Health Policy (TDI). I am writing to inform you that I believe, in good faith, Professor H. Gilbert Welch (also at TDI) has engaged in research misconduct. Please find below a brief summary of my points of concern.

1. On May 22, 2015, I presented my research on quantifying the contribution of breast cancer screening at a TDI Research-In-Progress workshop (see [research\\_in\\_progress.pdf](#)). Professor Welch introduced me at this workshop and attended it in its entirety.
2. Subsequent to the Research-in-Progress workshop, Professor Welch and I met in his office and he said that he had never thought of my research ideas to a) compute the share of incident breast cancers by tumor size over time and b) use the temporal patterns in tumor size-specific incidence rates to quantify the contribution of breast cancer screening.
  - 3a. Professor Welch and I continued to correspond by email and he asked for my research results to show his undergraduate class (see [email1.pdf](#)).
  - 3b. I shared my research result (See [email2.pdf](#)). I specifically wrote in my email "If this result/figure ultimately becomes part of a paper, I'd like the opportunity to be a coauthor...".
  - 3c. Professor Welch replied to my email (see [email3.pdf](#)) and wrote "Thanks much. No worries about this appearing in a paper – this is for class (less for content, more for the importance of denominators)."
4. On October 13, 2016, Professor Welch published an article in the New England Journal of Medicine entitled "Breast-Cancer Tumor Size, Overdiagnosis, and Mammography Screening Effectiveness" (see [nejm.pdf](#)). I believe Professor Welch appropriated my research ideas and research results. For example, the result in Figure 2 of Welch et al. (2016) is based on my research ideas and results that I shared with Professor Welch. This appropriation of my research ideas and results occurred without my knowledge or consent.

Please let me know if you require additional information for the preliminary assessment.

Kind regards,  
Samir Soneji

Samir Soneji, PhD  
Assistant Professor  
Dartmouth College