



The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

EDITORIAL OFFICE

August 10, 2018

David Kotz, Ph.D., Dean R. Madden, Ph.D.

Office of the Provost

6004 Parkhurst Hall, Suite 111

Hanover, NH 03755

cc: Samir Soneji, Ph.D.; Hiram Beltrán-Sánchez, Ph.D.; H. Gilbert Welch, M.D.; Philip C. Prorok, Ph.D.; A. James O'Malley, Ph.D.; and Barnett S. Kramer, M.D., M.P.H.

Dear Professors Kotz and Madden,

Thank you for your e-mail communication of June 15, 2018, concerning the outcome of an investigation into alleged research misconduct by Professor H. Gilbert Welch, a faculty member of your institution, involving, in part, the work we published on October 13, 2016, entitled "Breast-Cancer Tumor Size, Overdiagnosis, and Mammography Screening Effectiveness." We have examined the materials about this matter that you provided for us exclusively in hard copy and have followed our prescribed policies with respect to such allegations.

Our opinion in this matter, which is concordant with that of the United States Office of Research Integrity, is that this is an authorship dispute. The complainant party in this matter claims that he was not given adequate recognition for his contribution to the work we published. We do not deem this sufficient grounds for retraction of the article, of which Professor Welch is the corresponding author. We are happy to work with you and the article authors to reach a solution whereby sufficient acknowledgment is given so that the contribution of the complainant is adequately recognized.

We have included both Welch and Soneji as recipients of this letter. Otherwise, as agreed, the staff of the *New England Journal of Medicine* and Dartmouth College will hold this communication in confidence. Furthermore, we have destroyed the single copy of the materials you forwarded to us.

Sincerely,

Jeffrey M. Drazen, M.D.
Editor-in-Chief
New England Journal of Medicine
Distinguished Parker B. Francis
Professor of Medicine
Harvard Medical School

Dan L. Longo, M.D., M.A.C.P.
Deputy Editor
New England Journal of Medicine
Professor of Medicine
Harvard Medical School
Senior Physician
Brigham and Women's Hospital