

**From:** [Scian,Michael P](#)  
**To:** [Cooke,Irene](#); [Moore,Christina S](#)  
**Subject:** FW: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)  
**Date:** Monday, June 26, 2017 11:13:00 AM  
**Attachments:** [ol-39-18-5355.pdf](#)

---

Please see the attached and the links in the email below.

MIke

-----Original Message-----

From: Campillo, Anthony [<mailto:ACAMPI@osa.org>]  
Sent: Sunday, June 25, 2017 1:16 PM  
To: Scian,Michael P  
Cc: Ethics  
Subject: FW: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)

Hi Mike

The retraction document has now been published (see links in Kelly Cohen's email below). Also, the original article now has a retracted watermark over the journal website version (link also below).

Best regards  
Tony

-----Original Message-----

From: Cohen, Kelly  
Sent: Friday, June 23, 2017 2:45 PM  
To: Campillo, Anthony  
Subject: RE: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)

Hi Tony,

The Retraction Notice has been published and the original OL article now has a Retraction watermark. We realized the retraction notice was not made open access when it was posted so that has been corrected.

<https://www.osapublishing.org/ol/abstract.cfm?uri=ol-42-13-2406>

<https://www.osapublishing.org/ol/abstract.cfm?&uri=ol-39-18-5355>

We certainly learned a lot during this process! Alison was telling me yesterday about a new request from an author to retract a paper. I think it's from one of the JOSAs. The EiC is looking at it now. We'll let you know if there are any ethical concerns for that one.

Have a nice weekend,  
Kelly

-----Original Message-----

From: Campillo, Anthony  
Sent: Friday, June 09, 2017 11:00 AM  
To: Cohen, Kelly  
Subject: FW: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)

Hi Kelly

Where are we in the UF paper retraction. UF is asking (see below).

Regards  
Tony

---

From: Scian,Michael P [<mailto:scianmp@ufl.edu>]  
Sent: Thursday, June 8, 2017 1:52 PM  
To: Campillo, Anthony  
Subject: RE: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)

Dear Tony,

Could you please provide an update as to where you are in the retraction process? Also, please let me know if we can answer any questions you have.

Sincerely,

Mike

From: Campillo, Anthony [<mailto:ACAMPI@osa.org>]  
Sent: Wednesday, May 10, 2017 12:50 PM  
To: Scian,Michael P  
Subject: RE: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)

Dear Mike

Thanks for the UF Office of Research letter supporting retraction of the Yao et al 2014 paper and providing details of your investigation into Yao's misconduct. It's very helpful to our Panel.

Sincerely,

Tony Campillo

From: Scian,Michael P [<mailto:scianmp@ufl.edu>]  
Sent: Tuesday, May 09, 2017 1:32 PM  
To: Campillo, Anthony  
Cc: Cooke,Irene; Moore,Christina S; Yao,Lei  
Subject: FW: UF Investigation Support Letter for Retractions: (39 5355-5358)

Dear Dr. Anthony J. Campillo,

Please see the attached letter from the University of Florida in response to your request (copied below) for information concerning the research misconduct investigation. This investigation is associated with the retraction relating to (2014 Sept.; 39 5355-5358.), Finite-element-based photoacoustic imaging of absolute temperature in tissue, from Dr. Yao, the senior author.

Please let me know if you have any questions.

Sincerely,

Mike Scian MBA JD  
Assistant Director of Compliance  
Office of Research  
University of Florida  
352 846-3533

---

From: Campillo, Anthony <ACAMPI@osa.org<<mailto:ACAMPI@osa.org>>>  
Sent: Tuesday, May 2, 2017 11:14 AM  
To: Yao,Lei; Jiang,Huabei; Huang,Hua  
Cc: Ethics; Cohen, Kelly  
Subject: Retraction of Optics Letters 39 (2014) 5355 (Ms OL 212008)

Dr. Lei Yao  
Department of Biomedical Engineering  
University of Florida  
Gainesville FL 32611

Dear Dr. Yao

I am the Chair of the OSA Editorial Ethics Review Panel. Kelly Cohen has forwarded your request to the Panel to retract your paper, "Finite-element-based photoacoustic imaging of absolute temperature in tissue", L. Yao, H. Huang and H. Jiang, Optics Letters 39 (2014) 5355 [Ms # 212008]. As Ms. Cohen has already informed you the OSA does not ordinarily allow paper retractions. However, we do make an exception when unethical behavior occurs during the research or writing phase of the manuscript. I am contacting you because the Panel will need more information from you and your Department before it approves such a retraction.

I've read the correspondence you sent regarding retraction of your 2014 paper as well as your attempt at submitting an Erratum ( Ms # 279414). You have reported that a University of Florida investigative committee has determined that unethical behavior occurred. It appears you 'cherry picked' experimental data (i.e., retaining data in agreement with your theory and ignoring data that contradicted it) in order to confirm your model. If true, this is against our Ethical Guidelines, specifically paragraph 2 of Obligations of Authors which forbids "selective reporting of data to mislead or deceive" (see [https://www.osapublishing.org/submit/review/ethical\\_guidelines\(jan2012\).pdf](https://www.osapublishing.org/submit/review/ethical_guidelines(jan2012).pdf) ). You also didn't include error bars in published graphs as also required by paragraph 2.

Before the Panel approves the retraction, you will need to have the Chair of the investigative committee contact the Panel and confirm that the committee found unethical behavior occurring and approves of the paper's retraction.

Furthermore, before you, your coauthors and the committee make a final decision regarding retraction I'd like you all to understand the process OSA employs. First, retracting a paper doesn't imply that it simply disappears and all evidence of wrongdoing is erased and forgotten. While the OSA blocks the text of the paper from the Optics Letters readership, the paper's title and authorship still appears in the table of contents and an abstract page is still available. A Publisher's Note appears on the abstract page and replaces the original abstract. The Note will likely contain wording to the effect saying:

"The paper, "Finite-element-based photoacoustic imaging of absolute temperature in tissue", by L. Yao, H. Huang and H. Jiang, Opt. Lett. 39 5355 (2014) has been retracted at the request of the authors. This manuscript should have not been submitted for publication because the authors inappropriately and selectively reported their data, which is against OSA Ethical Guidelines."

The Panel looks forward to receiving a statement from the investigative committee summarizing their conclusions as well as agreeing with the retraction of the paper.

Sincerely

Dr. Anthony J. Campillo

Chair, OSA Editorial Ethics Review Panel

OSA, The Optical Society

2010 Massachusetts Ave., NW

Washington, DC 20036 USA

acampi@osa.org<<mailto:acampi@osa.org>>

703.300.2471