

Dear Dr. Schulz

Firstly, I would like to thank you for the efforts that you are devoting to keep your journals as safe as you can.

Please note that I was an MSc student at UM. Dr. Maan and Prof. Ali were my advisors. I spent two years at UM but unfortunately, and because of personal issues with Dr. Maan, I have withdrawn from The M. Sc. program. As part of my MSc thesis at UM, I conducted experimental work on the preparation, characterization, and application of DESs in the dehydration of natural gas. All material included in the two articles was based on my work during my stay at UM as a student.

Please be advised that we submitted our article to JTICE and I was the first author. After the article was accepted and published online (please see attachment 01) Dr. Maan wanted to change the order of the authors by putting his name as the first author without informing me (please see attachment 02). The respected Editor of the journal did not accept this change except after receiving the written permission from all co-authors (please see attachment 03). He told the Editor that he could not contact me although he knew my contact information and we were both involved in indirect dialog trying to sort out the dispute (please see attachment 04.). As I mentioned the Editor refused to do so without a written permission from all co-authors, then Dr. Maan requested to withdraw the article because he could not convince me with the reason for changing the order of authors (please see attachment 05) . The Editor sent me an email which included all previous communication with Dr. Maan (please see the attachment 06). Just at that time I understood what was going on. The Editor of the journal requested my permission to accept the change in order. I did not agree to lose my own effort but it was my first article and I was advised by some senior researchers to accept it because Dr. Maan, as a corresponding author, has the right to withdraw the article. Based on that advice I sent a letter to the journal and I accepted the change of order (please see the attachment 07).

Secondly, I want to inform you that there is a personal not academic problem with Dr. Maan Hayyan that I consider it the main reason why the two co-authors (Maan Hayyan and Prof Mohd Ali Hashem) sent you an email regarding the accepted article.

In our article published in The Journal of Taiwan Institute of Chemical Engineers (JTICE) we studied the Freezing point and water content of the same DES (Phophonium based DES) which they rise its issue of FTIR. The mentioned properties were studied before our work but we did include it to compare it with the other DESs.

The question is why they mentioned the FTIR without saying anything about the other properties (please see the attached article 01 and article 02 that studied the above mentioned properties for the same DES before our article published in TICE).

I agree that there is similarity between our two articles but this is because we used the results of two FTIR runs for the same DES. In addition, we used the disputed graph for the sake of comparison only. I really did not know that I had to refer to our article in TICE. This was my first experience in submitting a manuscript to a journal and I had to do this alone because of the withdrawal from MSc at UM. Please note, despite my withdrawal from the MSc program at UM I acknowledged the financial support of both UM and UMiLC at UM. All the necessary data was with me and I could wait for a few months until I join another university and submit the manuscript as part of my work at the new institution. However, I knew for sure that this is not ethical.

Regarding my contribution in the article, I am the one who conducted the experiments and wrote the manuscript and I participated in preparing the Response to Reviewers' comments with Dr. AlNashef.

I thought that Prof. Ali and Dr. Maan would be happy to be part of this work. I informed Dr. AlNashef and he accepted to help me in revising the manuscript and preparing a Response to Reviewers' comments. Of course, Prof. Ali and Dr. Maan knew about the results that were included in the disputed article (please see attachment 08 and forwarded email).

This is a personal Problem with Dr. Maan that I see he is trying to make it academic problem. I do respect Prof. Ali and I had special relationship with him during my stay at UM, however, Dr. Maan was able to poison this relation since Prof. Ali was busy all the time and the direct supervision was by Dr. Maan.

Finally, if I did any mistake I assure you that it was because of the lack of experience and having no advisor to guide me through this new endeavor that I was forced to make.

I do apologize for any inconvenience that this issue may have caused to you or to anyone else.

My Best Respect